

Encoding Collatz-like problems into termination of string rewriting

Emre Yolcu

Computer Science Department
Carnegie Mellon University

with Scott Aaronson and Marijn Heule

Collatz conjecture

$$C(n) = \begin{cases} n/2 & \text{if } n \equiv 0 \pmod{2} \\ 3n + 1 & \text{if } n \equiv 1 \pmod{2} \end{cases}$$

Conjecture

For all $n \in \mathbb{N}^+$, the trajectory $n, C(n), C(C(n)), \dots$ reaches 1.

¹<https://pcbarina.fit.vutbr.cz/>

Collatz conjecture

$$C(n) = \begin{cases} n/2 & \text{if } n \equiv 0 \pmod{2} \\ 3n + 1 & \text{if } n \equiv 1 \pmod{2} \end{cases}$$

Conjecture

For all $n \in \mathbb{N}^+$, the trajectory $n, C(n), C(C(n)), \dots$ reaches 1.

Verified for all n below 955×2^{60} as of today.¹

¹<https://pcbarina.fit.vutbr.cz/>

String rewriting

Σ alphabet

$\ell \rightarrow r$ rewrite rule

R rewriting system

$\rightarrow_R$ rewrite relation

Example: $R = \{ab \rightarrow ba\}$

$\underline{a}bbab \rightarrow_R b\underline{a}bab \rightarrow_R bba\underline{a}b \rightarrow_R bb\underline{a}ba \rightarrow_R bbbaa$

Termination

Definition

R is *terminating* if there is no infinite chain

$$X_0 \rightarrow_R X_1 \rightarrow_R X_2 \rightarrow_R \cdots$$

where $X_i \in \Sigma^*$.

Termination

Definition

R is *terminating* if there is no infinite chain

$$X_0 \rightarrow_R X_1 \rightarrow_R X_2 \rightarrow_R \cdots$$

where $X_i \in \Sigma^*$.

Theorem

R is *terminating* iff there is a well-founded order $\succ$ such that for all $X, Y \in \Sigma^*$, if $X \rightarrow_R Y$ then $X \succ Y$.

Interpretation method [Manna and Ness, 1970]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix some domain A equipped with a well-founded order $\succ$.

Interpretation method [Manna and Ness, 1970]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix some domain A equipped with a well-founded order $\succ$.
2. Translate each $s \in \Sigma$ into a monotone function $[s]: A \rightarrow A$ such that for each $\ell \rightarrow r \in R$,

$$[\ell](x) \succ [r](x) \text{ for all } x \in A,$$

where for a string $T = t_1 \dots t_n$ we define $[T] := [t_1] \circ \dots \circ [t_n]$.

Interpretation method [Manna and Ness, 1970]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix some domain A equipped with a well-founded order $\succ$.
2. Translate each $s \in \Sigma$ into a monotone function $[s]: A \rightarrow A$ such that for each $\ell \rightarrow r \in R$,

$$[\ell](x) \succ [r](x) \text{ for all } x \in A,$$

where for a string $T = t_1 \dots t_n$ we define $[T] := [t_1] \circ \dots \circ [t_n]$.

Example: $R = \{ab \rightarrow ba\}$. Fix the domain $(A, \succ)$ to be $(\mathbb{N}^+, >)$.

Interpretation method [Manna and Ness, 1970]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix some domain A equipped with a well-founded order $\succ$.
2. Translate each $s \in \Sigma$ into a monotone function $[s]: A \rightarrow A$ such that for each $\ell \rightarrow r \in R$,

$$[\ell](x) \succ [r](x) \text{ for all } x \in A,$$

where for a string $T = t_1 \dots t_n$ we define $[T] := [t_1] \circ \dots \circ [t_n]$.

Example: $R = \{ab \rightarrow ba\}$. Fix the domain $(A, \succ)$ to be $(\mathbb{N}^+, >)$.
With the interpretations $[a](x) = x^2$ and $[b](x) = x + 1$,

$$[ab](x) = (x + 1)^2 > x^2 + 1 = [ba](x) \text{ for all } x \in \mathbb{N}^+.$$

Matrix interpretations [Hofbauer and Waldmann, 2006]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix A to be $\mathbb{N}^d$ and equip it with the well-founded order $\succ$ defined as

$$\mathbf{x} \succ \mathbf{y} \iff x_1 > y_1 \wedge x_i \geq y_i \text{ for } i \in \{2, 3, \dots, d\}.$$

Matrix interpretations [Hofbauer and Waldmann, 2006]

To prove that a rewriting system R with alphabet Σ is terminating:

1. Fix A to be $\mathbb{N}^d$ and equip it with the well-founded order $\succ$ defined as

$$\mathbf{x} \succ \mathbf{y} \iff x_1 > y_1 \wedge x_i \geq y_i \text{ for } i \in \{2, 3, \dots, d\}.$$

2. Look for an affine function $[s]: \mathbb{N}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^d$ for each $s \in \Sigma$ (i.e., matrices $\mathbf{M}_s$ and vectors $\mathbf{v}_s$) such that for each $\ell \rightarrow r \in R$,

$$[\ell](\mathbf{x}) = \mathbf{M}_\ell \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{v}_\ell \succ \mathbf{M}_r \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{v}_r = [r](\mathbf{x}) \text{ for all } \mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{N}^d.$$

Example proof

$$Z = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} aa \rightarrow bc \\ bb \rightarrow ac \\ cc \rightarrow ab \end{array} \right\}$$

Example proof

$$Z = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} aa \rightarrow bc \\ bb \rightarrow ac \\ cc \rightarrow ab \end{array} \right\}$$

$$[a](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 2 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[b](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[c](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 3 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example proof (cont.)

$$\mathbf{x} \succ \mathbf{y} \iff x_1 > y_1 \wedge x_i \geq y_i \text{ for } i \in \{2, 3, \dots, d\}.$$

It is decidable to check that for all $\mathbf{x}$,

$$[aa](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \succ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 3 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} = [bc](\mathbf{x}),$$

$$[bb](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 2 & 0 & 6 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 4 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 0 \\ 2 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix} \succ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 6 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 4 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix} = [ac](\mathbf{x}),$$

$$[cc](\mathbf{x}) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \\ 3 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} \succ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 3 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} = [ab](\mathbf{x}).$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$h11 \rightarrow 1h$$

$$11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond$$

$$h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond$$

$$1s \rightarrow s1$$

$$1t \rightarrow t111$$

$$\Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h$$

$$\Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond h111\Diamond \quad (3)$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1h1\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1t11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond t11111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond h11111\Diamond \quad (5)$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1h111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11h1\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11t11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1t11111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond t11111111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond h11111111\Diamond \quad (8)$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1h111111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11h1111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 111h11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1111h\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1111s\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 111s1\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11s11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1s111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond s1111\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond h1111\Diamond \quad (4)$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1h11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ & 1s \rightarrow s1 & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ & \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11h\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 11s\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1s1\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond s11\Diamond$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond h11\Diamond \quad (2)$$

Unary encoding [Zantema, 2005]

System $\mathcal{U}$:

$$\begin{array}{lll} h11 \rightarrow 1h & 11h\Diamond \rightarrow 11s\Diamond & h1\Diamond \rightarrow t11\Diamond \\ 1s \rightarrow s1 & & 1t \rightarrow t111 \\ \Diamond s \rightarrow \Diamond h & & \Diamond t \rightarrow \Diamond h \end{array}$$

Rewrite sequences:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \Diamond h1^{2n}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^n\Diamond & \text{for } n > 1 \\ \Diamond h1^{2n+1}\Diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \Diamond h1^{3n+2}\Diamond & \text{for } n \geq 0 \end{array}$$

Example run:

$$\Diamond 1h\Diamond \quad (1)$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$

$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$

$f0 \rightarrow 0f$

$f1 \rightarrow 0t$

$f2 \rightarrow 1f$

$t0 \rightarrow 1t$

$t1 \rightarrow 2f$

$t2 \rightarrow 2t$

$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$

$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$

$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$$f \triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$$

$$t \triangleright \rightarrow 2 \triangleright$$

$$f0 \rightarrow 0f$$

$$f1 \rightarrow 0t$$

$$f2 \rightarrow 1f$$

$$t0 \rightarrow 1t$$

$$t1 \rightarrow 2f$$

$$t2 \rightarrow 2t$$

$$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$$

$$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$$

$$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$$

Digits:

$$f = 0_2$$

$$t = 1_2$$

$$0 = 0_3$$

$$1 = 1_3$$

$$2 = 2_3$$

$$\triangleleft = 1_0$$

$$\triangleright = 0_1$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$\textcolor{red}{f}(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$\textcolor{red}{t}(x) = 2x + 1$	$\textcolor{red}{1}(x) = 3x + 1$	$\textcolor{red}{\triangleright}(x) = x$
	$\textcolor{red}{2}(x) = 3x + 2$	

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$\triangleleft 0 \triangleright$

$$(1_0 0_3 0_1 = 3)$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft t \triangleright \qquad (1_0 1_2 0_1 = 3)$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$\triangleleft 2 \triangleright$

$$(1_0 2_3 0_1 = \mathbf{5})$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft ft \triangleright \qquad (1_0 0_2 1_2 0_1 = \mathbf{5})$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft f 2 \triangleright \quad (1_0 0_2 2_3 0_1 = \mathbf{8})$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft 1 f \triangleright \quad (1_0 1_3 0_2 0_1 = \mathbf{8})$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft f f f \triangleright \quad (1_0 0_2 0_2 0_2 0_1 = \mathbf{8})$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft f f \triangleright \quad (1_0 0_2 0_2 0_1 = 4)$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$\triangleleft f \triangleright$

$$(1_0 0_2 0_1 = 2)$$

Mixed-base encoding

System $\mathcal{M}$:

$f\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$t\triangleright \rightarrow 2\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Digits: (Think of the digit n_b as applying the function $bx + n$.)

$f(x) = 2x$	$0(x) = 3x$	$\triangleleft(x) = 1$
$t(x) = 2x + 1$	$1(x) = 3x + 1$	$\triangleright(x) = x$
	$2(x) = 3x + 2$	

Example run:

$$\triangleleft \triangleright \qquad (1_0 0_1 = \mathbf{1})$$

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding

Definition

A sequence $x_1, x_2, \dots$ is $\mathbb{N}$ -*rational* if for some $d \in \mathbb{N}^+$ there exist $\mathbf{M} \in \mathbb{N}^{d \times d}$ and $\mathbf{v}, \mathbf{w} \in \mathbb{N}^d$ such that $x_n = \mathbf{v}^T \mathbf{M}^n \mathbf{w}$ for all n .

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding

Definition

A sequence $x_1, x_2, \dots$ is $\mathbb{N}$ -*rational* if for some $d \in \mathbb{N}^+$ there exist $\mathbf{M} \in \mathbb{N}^{d \times d}$ and $\mathbf{v}, \mathbf{w} \in \mathbb{N}^d$ such that $x_n = \mathbf{v}^T \mathbf{M}^n \mathbf{w}$ for all n .

Lemma (A “corollary” of Berstel’s theorem (1971))

No $\mathbb{N}$ -rational sequence $x_1, x_2, \dots$ satisfies $x_{8n+1} > x_{9n+2}$ for all n .

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding

Definition

A sequence $x_1, x_2, \dots$ is $\mathbb{N}$ -*rational* if for some $d \in \mathbb{N}^+$ there exist $\mathbf{M} \in \mathbb{N}^{d \times d}$ and $\mathbf{v}, \mathbf{w} \in \mathbb{N}^d$ such that $x_n = \mathbf{v}^T \mathbf{M}^n \mathbf{w}$ for all n .

Lemma (A “corollary” of Berstel’s theorem (1971))

No $\mathbb{N}$ -rational sequence $x_1, x_2, \dots$ satisfies $x_{8n+1} > x_{9n+2}$ for all n .

Lemma (Endrullis, Waldmann, Zantema (2008))

*If some collection of d -dimensional **affine** interpretations is useful for proving the termination of a rewriting system, then so is some other collection of $(d + 1)$ -dimensional **linear** interpretations.*

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding (cont.)

Theorem

Natural matrix interpretations (regardless of dimension) cannot be used for proving the termination of the rewriting system $\mathcal{U}$.

Proof idea. Suppose for a contradiction that there is a collection $\{\mathbf{M}_s\}_{s \in \Sigma}$ of (WLOG linear) d -dimensional interpretations for proving the termination of $\mathcal{U}$.

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding (cont.)

Theorem

Natural matrix interpretations (regardless of dimension) cannot be used for proving the termination of the rewriting system $\mathcal{U}$.

Proof idea. Suppose for a contradiction that there is a collection $\{\mathbf{M}_s\}_{s \in \Sigma}$ of (WLOG linear) d -dimensional interpretations for proving the termination of $\mathcal{U}$.

In this system, we may represent a positive integer k as $\diamond h 1^k \diamond$. Define

$$f_k := \mathbf{e}_1^T [\diamond h 1^k \diamond] (\mathbf{e}_d) = \mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h 1^k \diamond} \mathbf{e}_d = (\mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h}) \mathbf{M}_1^k (\mathbf{M}_{\diamond} \mathbf{e}_d),$$

so $f_1, f_2, \dots$ is an $\mathbb{N}$ -rational sequence.

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding (cont.)

Theorem

Natural matrix interpretations (regardless of dimension) cannot be used for proving the termination of the rewriting system $\mathcal{U}$.

Proof idea. Suppose for a contradiction that there is a collection $\{\mathbf{M}_s\}_{s \in \Sigma}$ of (WLOG linear) d -dimensional interpretations for proving the termination of $\mathcal{U}$.

In this system, we may represent a positive integer k as $\diamond h 1^k \diamond$. Define

$$f_k := \mathbf{e}_1^T [\diamond h 1^k \diamond] (\mathbf{e}_d) = \mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h 1^k \diamond} \mathbf{e}_d = (\mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h}) \mathbf{M}_1^k (\mathbf{M}_{\diamond} \mathbf{e}_d),$$

so $f_1, f_2, \dots$ is an $\mathbb{N}$ -rational sequence.

Applying the Collatz map three times to a number of the form $8n + 1$ gives $8n + 1 \mapsto 12n + 2 \mapsto 6n + 1 \mapsto 9n + 2$. Thus, $\mathcal{U}$ allows the rewrite sequence

$$\diamond h 1^{8n+1} \diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \diamond h 1^{9n+2} \diamond,$$

which requires the use of every single rule in the system.

Nonexistence of matrix proofs for unary encoding (cont.)

Theorem

Natural matrix interpretations (regardless of dimension) cannot be used for proving the termination of the rewriting system $\mathcal{U}$.

Proof idea. Suppose for a contradiction that there is a collection $\{\mathbf{M}_s\}_{s \in \Sigma}$ of (WLOG linear) d -dimensional interpretations for proving the termination of $\mathcal{U}$.

In this system, we may represent a positive integer k as $\diamond h 1^k \diamond$. Define

$$f_k := \mathbf{e}_1^T [\diamond h 1^k \diamond] (\mathbf{e}_d) = \mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h 1^k \diamond} \mathbf{e}_d = (\mathbf{e}_1^T \mathbf{M}_{\diamond h}) \mathbf{M}_1^k (\mathbf{M}_{\diamond} \mathbf{e}_d),$$

so $f_1, f_2, \dots$ is an $\mathbb{N}$ -rational sequence.

Applying the Collatz map three times to a number of the form $8n + 1$ gives $8n + 1 \mapsto 12n + 2 \mapsto 6n + 1 \mapsto 9n + 2$. Thus, $\mathcal{U}$ allows the rewrite sequence

$$\diamond h 1^{8n+1} \diamond \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow \diamond h 1^{9n+2} \diamond,$$

which requires the use of every single rule in the system.

Since $\{\mathbf{M}_s\}_{s \in \Sigma}$ is useful, we have $f_{8n+1} > f_{9n+2}$, contradicting earlier lemma. $\square$

Even worse

Zantema's challenge (2003):

$$W(n) = \begin{cases} 3n/2 & \text{if } n \equiv 0 \pmod{2} \\ \perp & \text{if } n \equiv 1 \pmod{2} \end{cases}$$

Unary system:

h11 $\rightarrow$ 1h

1h $\diamond$ $\rightarrow$ 1t $\diamond$

1t $\rightarrow$ t111

$\diamond$ t $\rightarrow$ $\diamond$ h

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Zantema's challenge (2003):

$$W(n) = \begin{cases} 3n/2 & \text{if } n \equiv 0 \pmod{2} \\ \perp & \text{if } n \equiv 1 \pmod{2} \end{cases}$$

Mixed-base system:

$f \triangleright \rightarrow 0 \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Mixed-base system:

$$\begin{array}{llll} f \triangleright \rightarrow 0 \triangleright & f 0 \rightarrow 0 f & t 0 \rightarrow 1 t & \triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t \\ & f 1 \rightarrow 0 t & t 1 \rightarrow 2 f & \triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft f f \\ & f 2 \rightarrow 1 f & t 2 \rightarrow 2 t & \triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft f t \end{array}$$

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 3360 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 5 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 2^5 \cdot 3 \cdot 5 \cdot 7 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 5 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 3360 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 5 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 5040 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 7560 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle \mathbf{11340} \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle \mathbf{17010} \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[\triangleleft](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x \quad [\triangleright](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} \quad [2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$$

Example run:

$$[\langle 25515 \rangle](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} x + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Switching to mixed-base encoding (cont.)

Farkas' map (2005):

$$F(n) = \begin{cases} \frac{n-1}{3} & \text{if } n \equiv 1 \pmod{3} \\ \frac{n}{2} & \text{if } n \equiv 0 \text{ or } n \equiv 2 \pmod{6} \\ \frac{3n+1}{2} & \text{if } n \equiv 3 \text{ or } n \equiv 5 \pmod{6} \end{cases}$$

Mixed-base system:

$1\triangleright \rightarrow \triangleright$	$f0 \rightarrow 0f$	$t0 \rightarrow 1t$	$\triangleleft 0 \rightarrow \triangleleft t$
$0f\triangleright \rightarrow 0\triangleright$	$f1 \rightarrow 0t$	$t1 \rightarrow 2f$	$\triangleleft 1 \rightarrow \triangleleft ff$
$1f\triangleright \rightarrow 1\triangleright$	$f2 \rightarrow 1f$	$t2 \rightarrow 2t$	$\triangleleft 2 \rightarrow \triangleleft ft$
$1t\triangleright \rightarrow 12\triangleright$			
$2t\triangleright \rightarrow 22\triangleright$			

Switching to mixed-base encoding (cont.)

Interpretations:

$$[f](x) = \begin{bmatrix} - & - & 2 & - \\ & 2 & 0 & - \\ 2 & - & - & - \\ - & - & - & - \end{bmatrix} x \oplus \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ - \\ - \\ - \end{bmatrix} \quad [t](x) = \begin{bmatrix} - & - & - & 2 \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & 0 \\ 2 & - & 2 & - \\ - & - & - & - \end{bmatrix} x \oplus \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ - \\ - \\ - \end{bmatrix}$$

$$[<](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ - \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} \quad [>](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & - & - & - & - \\ - & - & - & - & - \\ - & - & - & - & - \\ - & - & - & - & - \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[0](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 4 & 0 & - & - \\ - & 4 & - & - & - \\ - & 4 & 0 & - & - \\ 0 & 3 & 0 & - & - \\ - & - & - & - & - \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[1](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & - & - & - & - \\ - & 4 & 0 & - & - \\ - & 4 & 0 & - & - \\ 0 & - & - & - & - \\ 0 & 3 & 0 & - & - \end{bmatrix} x$$

$$[2](x) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & - & 0 & - & - \\ - & 4 & - & - & - \\ 0 & - & 1 & - & 0 \\ - & - & - & - & - \\ 0 & - & 0 & - & 0 \end{bmatrix} x$$

Theorem. For all $n \in \mathbb{N}^+$, the trajectory $F^{\mathbb{N}}(n)$ contains 1.

Proof. We proceed by induction. For $n = 1$ the result holds since $F^{\mathbb{N}}(1) = (1, 0, 0, \dots)$. Assuming it holds for all positive integers less than n , we will show that it holds for n . In particular, we will show that the trajectory of n reaches a number strictly smaller than n , which implies by the induction hypothesis that the trajectory contains 1. We split into three cases.

- (i) Assume $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$. Then $F(n) = (n-1)/3$ is smaller than n .
- (ii) Assume $n \equiv 0$ or $n \equiv 2 \pmod{6}$. Then $F(n) = n/2$ is smaller than n .
- (iii) Assume $n \equiv 3$ or $n \equiv 5 \pmod{6}$. Denote n by N_1 , and consider the trajectory $F^{\mathbb{N}}(N_1) = (N_1, N_2, N_3, \dots)$. Let

$$k = \sup \left\{ i \in \mathbb{N}^+ \mid N_j = \frac{3N_{j-1} + 1}{2} \text{ for all } 1 < j \leq i \right\}.$$

We cannot have $k = \infty$, i.e., F cannot apply $N \mapsto (3N+1)/2$ indefinitely, since for such a sequence we have

$$N_j + 1 = \left(\frac{3}{2}\right)^j (N_1 + 1).$$

As all the elements in the trajectory have to be integers, $k-1$ cannot exceed the number of times that $N_1 + 1$ can be divided by 2, so k is finite. Consider

$$N_{k+1} = \left(\frac{3}{2}\right)^k (N_1 + 1) - 1.$$

It is of the form $3^k \cdot L - 1$ for some positive integer L , so we know that either $N_{k+1} \equiv 2 \pmod{6}$ or $N_{k+1} \equiv 5 \pmod{6}$. Due to the way k is defined, N_{k+1} cannot be congruent to 5 (mod 6), so we have $N_{k+1} \equiv 2 \pmod{6}$. In particular, N_{k+1} is even, so $(\frac{3}{2})^k (N_1 + 1)$ is odd, which in turn implies that $\frac{N_1 + 1}{2^k}$ is odd, i.e., we have $N_1 = 2^k \cdot (2M + 1) - 1$ for some natural number M . Then, N_{k+1} satisfies

$$N_{k+1} = 3^k \cdot (2M + 1) - 1 = 3^k \cdot 2M + 3^k - 1.$$

Since $N_{k+1} \equiv 2 \pmod{6}$, we can deduce that

$$F(N_{k+1}) = \frac{N_{k+1}}{2} = \frac{3^k \cdot 2M + 3^k - 1}{2} \equiv 1 \pmod{3},$$

and furthermore,

$$F^2(N_{k+1}) = \frac{3^k \cdot 2M + 3^k - 1}{2} = 3^{k-1} \cdot 2M + 3^{k-1} - 1 \equiv 2 \pmod{6}.$$

Repeatedly applying F in the above manner gives $F^{2k}(N_{k+1}) = 2M$. Since $k \geq 1$, we have $2M < 2^k \cdot (2M + 1) - 1 = N_1 = n$, and so the trajectory $F^{\mathbb{N}}(n)$ reaches a number strictly smaller than n . $\square$